Reviewing by Literature

Schaperai Badri, Sandro Kurpiers
Agenda

I. Literature Resources

II. Conducting a Literature Review

III. Discussion
Motivation

• Early in their research, most students are advised by their supervisors to “study the literature”

• In the beginning it is often hard to know what this means, and where to start
Literature Resources

- Books
- Journals
- Conference and Workshop proceedings
- Reports
- Newspapers, Magazines, Radio and TV
- Internet
- Other Resources
Books

• Textbooks:
  – Useful as introductory sources
  – Give guidance on particular methods or techniques
  – Are aimed to students on taught courses NOT at academic researchers!!

• Monographs
  – Are aimed at an academic audience (can be cited)
  – Often survey a field in depth and discuss ideas in detail
Journals

• There you should find information on the current thinking and research

• Can be useful to start first with journal articles that are themselves a survey of the literature on a particular topic

• Journals containing “refereed“ articles are rated more highly than those with non-refereed articles

• Can take two years or more before appearing in print
Journal Rankings

Ranked MIS Journals (Based on ISWorld)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Journal Name</th>
<th>ProQuest (ABI/INFORM)</th>
<th>Elsevier (ScienceDirect)</th>
<th>INFORMS</th>
<th>IEEE (Comp Soc &amp; Xplore)</th>
<th>Wilson (Omnifile)</th>
<th>Thomson (G. Bas, OneFile)</th>
<th>ACM (Digital Lib)</th>
<th>JSTOR</th>
<th>Blackwell (Synergy)</th>
<th>LEA Journals</th>
<th>EBSCOhost</th>
<th>Free Full Text Web Access</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>MIS Quarterly</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Information Systems Research</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Communications of the ACM</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Management Science</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Journal of MIS</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Artificial Intelligence</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Decision Sciences</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Harvard Business Review</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>IEEE Transactions (various)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>AI Magazine</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>European Journal of IS</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Decision Support Systems</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>IEEE Software</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Information &amp; Management</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>ACM Transactions on DB Sys</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Levvy and Ellis 2006

Other (German) Ranking: VHB Jourqual: [http://vhbonline.org/service/jourqual/](http://vhbonline.org/service/jourqual/)
Conference and Workshop proceedings

• There you can find the most up-to-date theories

• Can be difficult for students to know the standard of a conference

• Can be hard to obtain copies of conference and workshop papers
Reports

• Market research reports (e.g. by consultancy groups)

• Government reports

• Often difficult to obtain / expensive

• Most of them are not reviewed by objective outsiders

• Always question the interests of the publisher
Newspapers, Magazines, Radio and TV

• Can be valuable resources for up-to-date information

• Often easy to access online

• Useful for finding a way into a subject

• Many press and broadcasting organizations are biased politically or geographically

• No peer review
Internet

• Includes many of the just mentioned resources as a digital copy

• Note that anyone can at any time put material online and offline

• Easy to download tons of material but you also have to read them

• Don’t lose yourself in too many links
Other Resources

• Multimedia “literature"

• Gateways (academic portals)

• Resource catalogues and online databases (like: opac)

• Online literature search services (see next Slide)

• People
Selection of Literature Search Services

- ACM Digital Library: http://dl.acm.org/dl.cfm
- CiteSeerx: http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu
- EBSCOhost: http://search.ebscohost.com/
- Google Scholar: http://scholar.google.de
- IEEE Xplore: http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/
- IngentaConnect: http://www.ingentaconnect.com/
- JSTOR: http://www.jstor.org/
- Microsoft Academic Search: http://academic.research.microsoft.com/
- Science Direct: http://www.sciencedirect.com/
- Scirus: http://www.scirus.com/
- Web of Knowledge: http://wokinfo.com/
- Base Search: http://www.base-search.net/
- WorldCat: http://www.worldcat.org/
Summary

1. Wissenschaftliche Zeitschriftenaufsätze
2. Begutachtete Beiträge in Tagungsbänden (Konferenzen)
3. Monographien (Dissertationen, Fachbücher, etc.)
4. Herausgeberwerke / Handwörterbücher
5. Lehrbücher / Sonstige Monographien

Source: Spann 2013, LMU ECM
Conducting a Literature Review

- Searching
- Obtaining
- Assessing
- Reading
- Critically evaluating
- Writing a critical review
- Never plagiarize
Searching

- Initially define some keywords or search terms
- Use search engines and online databases to produce a list of potentially useful references
- Think about your topic and clarify your ideas
- Define your topic in one phrase
- Develop a (new) list of potentially useful references
Obtaining

- Check the catalogue of your library
  [https://opacplus-ub-uni-muenchen-de.emedien.ub.uni-muenchen.de/](https://opacplus-ub-uni-muenchen-de.emedien.ub.uni-muenchen.de/)

- Use inter-library loan

- LMU students can access a huge range of E-Media for free

- Other university websites can also be helpful
Assessing

• Assess the credibility of any text that you find

• Questions you can ask yourself about a text:
  (e.g. book)
  – Is the author someone eminent in the field?
  – Have you heard of the publisher before?
  – Is the publisher a university press?
  – Is the book in a subsequent edition?
• Questions you can ask yourself about a Journal:
  – Is it aimed at academics or practitioners?
  – How long has the Journal existed? (look at the volume number)
  – Does the Journal provide a list of its editorial board and advisors and do these people seem to be of high standing?
  – Does the Journal state clearly its policy for reviewing articles? (Concentrate on articles that are peer reviewed)
• Questions you can ask yourself about conferences and workshops:
  – Is it an academic conference?
  – Is the conference or workshop well established?
  – Does the conference or workshop give details about its programme committee?
  – Does it make clear its reviewing policy or were all papers accepted for presentation?
• Questions you can ask yourself about Internet sources:
  – Does the website make clear who owns it and provide contact details if you want to query something?
  – Does the website seem to be authoritative (e.g. owned by an university or government)?
  – Does the website make clear its purpose, including any disclaimers?
  – Does the website show when it was last updated and is it up-to-date?
Reading

• Academic reading means to “gut“ a text quickly

• If available concentrate first on the abstract

• Look at the section headings

• Usually you find key ideas of a paragraph in the first and last sentences
Critically evaluating

• Evaluate the relevance of a text to your own research

• Are there parts you disagree with?

• Even high quality papers can have omissions
Recording

• Devise a system to keep track of the material you’re reading and evaluating

• Keep note of:
  – A brief summary of the content
  – A brief summary of your evaluation
  – Bibliographic details of literature source (Citavi, EndNote…)

• Backup copies of your electronic data
Writing a critical review

• It’s not a summary of everything you have read

• It’s a discussion of only the material you have read that is directly relevant to your research

• Don’t make your review author-centric, but structure around concepts

• Check details of the referencing system you are expected to use
Plagiarism

• Means that you have used someone else’s words or ideas without giving them credit

• Don’t Copy/Paste

• Avoid plagiarism by quoting !!
Take-Home Messages

• Wikipedia, Newspapers, Textbooks... provide a good introduction to the subject, but they’re not scientific literature

• Use Monographs and (peer reviewed) Journals as scientific sources

• Make a step-by-step structured literature review

• Always evaluate critically
Discussion
Sources


